

FINAL WORKSHOP REPORT

Strengthening Vietnamese SPS Capacities for Trade - *Improving safety and quality of fresh vegetables through the value chain approach*-MTF/VIE/046/STF

STDF/PG/259

The final workshop on the project “Strengthening Vietnamese SPS Capacities for Trade - *Improving safety and quality of fresh vegetables through the value chain approach*” was held in Hanoi on 21st August 2012. This report provides an overview of the process, content and outcomes of the workshop, which was developed by Fruit and Vegetable Research Institute (FAVRI) as the project implementing agency under Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD).



The project was implemented by FAVRI as a part of FAO’ Technical Cooperation Program in Vietnam funded by WTO during 2010-2012.

1-Participants of the Workshop:

63 workshop participants included representatives from FAO RAP and FAO Hanoi, MARD Departments, agricultural research institutes (VAAS and FAVRI), and local partners such as provincial Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) and agencies, districts, communes, cooperatives, processing companies, and traders. Especially, there were farmers as project beneficiaries from three selected provinces who also attended the workshop. Participants from other neighboring provinces in Hanoi and Vinh Phuc, public media agencies also presented in the workshop. The list of participants and observers are enclosed as in the annex 2 below.

2-The Workshop Proceeding:

The final workshop was held at the Meeting Room of Army Guesthouse, No.33C Pham Ngu Lao, Hoan Kiem, Hanoi. Agenda of workshop appeared in the below annex 2. The workshop’s objectives were to review all outputs, outcomes and impacts of the project implementation.

A video clip on field day/conference in three project locations was shown at the beginning of the workshop. The workshop was opened by Dr. Trinh Khac Quang, NPD and DG of FAVRI. Ms. Yuriko Shoji on the behalf of FAO Hanoi and Dr. Nguyen Van Bo on the behalf of Vietnam Academy of Agricultural Sciences provided the welcoming address.

On behalf of the project team, National Project Coordinator (NPC) presented a report on the overview of the project implementation process, achievements, lessons learnt and recommendations.

The presentation was complemented with four presentations on VietGAP training, Farm Business training, field demonstrations and the establishment of quality/safety management system by FAVRI technical staffs as main technical assistance sources of the project. Detail of presentation will be soon posted in the project website: gap-sps.org.vn.

The workshop participants were enabled to discuss on the project objectives, activities, implementation process, achievements and lessons learnt. Opinions from researchers, managers, traders and farmers also come up with recommendations for following-up activities after the project termination and all presented their wish to continue receiving supports from WTO through STDF and FAO Technical Cooperation Program for one more phase of this type of project.

At the end of the workshop, the main conclusions were made together with lessons learnt and recommendations.

3-The Workshop Results and Conclusions:

The conclusions, lessons learnt and recommendations were withdrawn from discussions at the project Final Workshop in Hanoi on August 21st 2012. The conclusions as the following:

1. The project objectives were very suitable to the government policy, therefore project received highly supports of concerned organizations and farmers;
2. Project has generated interest of farmers, buyers/ markets and other organizations;
3. Project generally met the objectives set out in terms of SPS requirements, farm business management, quality control, marketing (limited extent);
4. Good coordination and cooperation between FAO, FAVRI and partners benefited from project has contributed to successful implementation of the project activities;
5. The project had established a good extension network at 3 provinces for farmers' participation to FFS and FBS training. This network will be functioned in sustainable way after project ending
6. Many technical materials using for TOT/FFS and FBS training has been drafted, printed and distributed. These training materials not only used in Vietnam, but also can be used for sharing information with other countries in the region;
7. Training materials were suitable for the products identified;
8. Demonstration sites were found to be very effective;
9. Safety aspects covered, however Quality aspects are also important, but not covered under the project – quality requires consistency over time;
10. Labeling is an important aspect for both branding as well as traceability;
11. Closer linkages between the four partners is an essential component;
12. Brand building is important – for which promotion as well as mass media activities needed;
13. Need to have quantities as well as diversity in a produce;
14. Sustainability needs longer time for stabilizing;
15. Awareness of project partners on new practices has been evidently recorded, initially farmers has changed their behavior on farming practices, processing, distribution mode and consumers' requirements in order to protect community health and environment, etc.;
16. Project established a linkage between partners (producers, processors, traders, and consumers) as a value chain approach through meeting/workshops, field day, etc.
17. Technical training materials and reports on the project's implementation and results have been published in the project website.

However, the discussions also pointed out some main weakness during the implementation process, including:

- a. Because of some reasons, the project started late in comparison with those planned, therefore, the project management had to request for 6 month extension until 31/8/2012;
- b. One of main reasons of late implementation of the project activities was the detail work-plan (implementation plan) and budget revision was late approved that affecting to the project implementation process;
- c. Late recruitment of international consultants also influenced to the implementation progress;
- d. Short crop seasons making difficult to mobilize resources for field works and implementation;
- e. Changing awareness and behavior of farmers on production with new practices, business management, etc. needs longer time and continuous process and not possible to make changes in a short time period.

4-Lessons Learnt from the Project:

There are six lessons learnt from the project implementation including:

1. Needs close coordination between central and local authorities, project site and all partners under and outside of the project benefited;
2. Needs more supports and participations of the central and local governments. The issue is not under technical but management aspects, that too many government agencies (such as MARD, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Trade, etc) are being involved in the process of food safety management, but there is not very clear who will be the last responsible entity of food safety insurance;
3. Work plan/implementation plan and budget allocation needs to be well planned and early approved from beginning of the project cycle;
4. Selection of good project management team and establishment of a good extension network at the province/district level for effective coordination and implementation of FFS training for farmers, and setting-up of field demonstrations would strengthen effectiveness and impact of the capacity building efforts;
5. Project should act as a linkage mechanism of all partners (producers, processors, traders, and consumers) to form as a complete value chain from the production, distribution and consumption of safe and higher quality vegetable products.
6. The project on SPS should contribute to VietGAP guidelines by MARD: how to simplify for farmers' easy understanding

5-The Workshop Recommendations:

There were many recommendations discussed during the final workshop but some main recommendations were the following:

1. Wishes to continue receiving technical and financial supports from WTO and FAO, Government and other donor agencies for extension of this program/project which resulted from very clear outcomes and impacts at the first phase of the project implementation;
2. Needs very clear policy from the government in the whole process from production, distribution to consumption in order to encourage farmers to produce safer and higher quality vegetables. This process requires coordination roles and efforts from line ministry;
3. Aim should be increasing VietGAP certification – these needs to develop clear and uniform, and simple guidelines on certification procedures;

4. Extension network should be established at the province/district level in order to improve new technical knowledge and perception of farmers;
5. Awareness and advocacy should be frequently and continuously doing in order to sustain project impacts. Increase publicity through mass media. Develop a brand image;
6. Study on cost benefit analysis namely: cost of implementation vs financial benefit (individual and country level) should be carried out;
7. Communication and dissemination of information in order to exchange experiences between difference production areas in the country and with other countries in the region, especially through the project website;
8. Linkage between research institutes, farmers, extension agencies and buyers/traders should be strengthened through the project activities, in which transparent information exchanges on availability of production volume and type of safe products, and market information (i.e., market requirements on type of products, quality, and selling prices, etc.) playing very important roles;
9. This type of project should pay attentions to the improvement not only safety aspect but also to improve product quality in order to meet market demands of commodity type (such as big, medium, small size, etc.), how to recognize a safe product (branding and/or labeling of safe products with clearly indicated original address/traceability, etc.);
10. More attentions should give to post-harvesting issues of how to reduce storing/handling and/or transportation damages of safe products;
11. Because of diversified vegetable products, it is recommended that this kind of project should start with an enterprise/producers' group producing various types of vegetables and linking with a safe vegetable buyer/trader in order to establish model of closed linkage mechanism for safe vegetable value chain from production to consumption.

At the end of workshop, participants suggested to formulate a concept note for submitting to STDF/WTO for consideration if possible for second phase. Main points for drafting concept note are:

- Expansion to other products for which training material needs to be developed and trainings/ demonstration sites developed and expanded to different areas;
- The implementation should cover all aspects of GAP namely safety, quality, environmental and workers health and safety;
- Simplified procedures and clear guidelines for the Certification system to be developed to ensure uniformity in certification by different agencies in Vietnam. The certification agencies should implement the criteria for certification bodies;
- Project should have a study on cost-benefit analysis (ie cost of implementation and benefits to all stakeholders including the country). The benefits should be both quantitative and qualitative;
- Brand name building and publicity and linkage to markets;
- Traceability aspects addressed with clear reflection/ demonstration of the same on the label;
- Educational program on local mass media.

List of attachments:

Annex 1: The Workshop Agenda

Annex 2: List of the workshop participants

Annex 1: THE WORKSHOP AGENDA

Date: Tuesday August 21, 2012

Venue: Meeting room at Army Guesthouse, No.33 Pham Ngu Lao, Hoan Kiem, Hanoi

Time	Subjects	Responsibility	Remarks
8:00-8:30	Registration Video clip on field day/conference	Organizer	Organizer
8:30-9:00	Introduction	Organizer	Mr. Bui Quang Dang
	Opening speech	NPD	Dr. Trinh Khac Quang
	Welcome address	FAO Rep. Hanoi	Ms. Yuriko Shoji
	Welcome address	Director VAAS	Dr. Nguyen Van Bo
	Scope of the Workshop	FAO RAP	Ms. Shashi Sareen
9:00-9:45	Presentation on the project implementation achievements, lesson learnt and recommendation	NPC	Mr. Nguyen Dinh Hung
9:45-10:00	Coffee break		
10:00-11:45	Presentation on VietGAP training	FAVRI	Ms To Thi Thu Ha
	Presentation on Business training	FAVRI	Mr. Hoang Bang An
	Presentation on field demonstrations	FAVRI	Ms Duong Kim Thoa
	Presentation on quality/safety management system	FAVRI	Mr. Do Dinh Ca
11:45-12:00	Summary of morning presentations		Ms. Shashi Sareen & Mr. Dam Quoc Tru
12:00-13:30	Lunch	all	
13:30-15:30	Linkage of production and marketing	FAVRI	Ms Nguyen Thi Tan Loc
	Farmers' views (from Lam Dong, Son La and Hung Yen)	Farmers	
	Presentation of partners in 3 provinces	Partners	Mr. Duan, Mr. Thinh, Mr. Luom
	Supermarket's view		
	Linkage between STDF projects in Vietnam	Cantho University	Mr. Le Nguyen Doan Duy
15:30-16:30	Open discussions	all	Ms. Shashi Sareen , Dr. Trinh Khac Quang & Mr. Dam Quoc Tru
16:30-17:00	Summary, findings, conclusions and future works		Ms. Shashi Sareen & Mr. Dam Quoc Tru
17:00-	Closing	NPD	Dr. Trinh Khac Quang

Annex 2: LIST OF THE WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS

No		Position	Agency/address (commune, village)
1.	Bui Quang Dang	Head	Inter. And Science Depart, FAVRI
2.	Bui Thu Phuong	Officer	Intimex
3.	Dam Quoc Tru	National Consultant	
4.	Dao Ngoc Chinh	Officer	Crop Production Dept/MARD
5.	Dinh Thi Xoa	Farmer	Van Ho Commune, Moc Chau, Son La
6.	Do Dinh Ca	Head	Safety and Quality Department FAVRI
7.	Doan Thi Chai	Deputy Director	DARD, Hung Yen province
8.	Doan Thu Huong	Officer	FAVRI
9.	Duong Kim Thoa	Researcher	FAVRI
10.	Hoang Bang An	Head	Marketing and Economic department
11.	Huynh Ngoc Thach	Vice Head	District Agricultural Department, Don Duong, Lam Dong
12.	Le Ben	Reporter	Agricultural Newspaper
13.	Le Nguyen Doan Duy	NPC	WTO Project in Can Tho University
14.	Le Thi Ha	Officer	FAVRI
15.	Le Thu Hang	Officer	Fivimart
16.	Le Van Bam	Director	Dept of Science & Technology/MARD
17.	Lee Taek Jong	Researcher	KOPIA office at FAVRI
18.	Luong Trac Kiem	Director	VietUc Processing Co. Ltd
19.	Massimo Pero		FAO, Hanoi
20.	Mui Thi Thiep	Farmer	Van Ho Commune, Moc Chau, Son La
21.	Nguyen Ba Tue	Vice director	Safety and Quality Department of Vinh Phuc province
22.	Nguyen Dinh Hung	NPC	FAVRI
23.	Nguyen Duc Tuan	Director	Processing Ngoc Yen Minh Co Ltd, Don Duong, Lam Dong province
24.	Nguyen Hai Yen	Reporter	Vietnam Television (VTV2)
25.	Nguyen Quoc Hung	Vice Director	FAVRI
26.	Nguyen Quoc Hung	Reporter	Vietnam Television (VTV2)
27.	Nguyen Quoc Vong	Vice Head	Group of International Consultant, QSEAP Project/MARD
28.	Nguyen Quynh Mai	Vice Director	Intimex
29.	Nguyen Thi Cham Hoa	Financial officer	Financial office, FAVRI
30.	Nguyen Thi Huong	Researcher	FAVRI
31.	Nguyen Thi Huong	Researcher	FAVRI
32.	Nguyen Thi Huong	Program officer	FAO Hanoi
33.	Nguyen Thi Luyen	Farmer	Dong Sang Commune, Moc Chau, Son La province
34.	Nguyen Thi Minh	Officer	CASRAD
35.	Nguyen Thi Phuong	Officer	Big Green
36.	Nguyen Thi Phuong Loan	Head	Crop production Division, DARD, Lam Dong province

37.	Nguyen Thi Tan Loc	Vice Head	Marketing and Economic department, (FAVRI)
38.	Nguyen Thi Thanh Thao	Officer	FAVRI
39.	Nguyen Thi Thu	Director	AgriFood International consulting
40.	Nguyen Tien Hung	Director	Big Green
41.	Nguyen Tuan Dung	Researcher	FAVRI
42.	Nguyen Van Bo	General Director	Vietnam Academy of Agriculture Science (VAAS)
43.	Nguyen Van Hoc	Deputy Chairman of	Kim Dong District peoples' Committee, Hung Yen province
44.	Nguyen Van Hung	Vice director	Plant Protection Dept/DARD, Son La
45.	Nguyen Van Lang	Chairman	Hiep Cuong Commune Peoples' Committee, Kim Dong, Hung Yen province
46.	Nguyen Van Linh	National Consultant	
47.	Nguyen Van Luom	Head	Thanh Nghia Cooperative, Don Duong, Lam Dong province
48.	Nguyen Van Son	Vice Director	DARD, Lam Dong
49.	Nguyen Van Thinh	Director	19/5 Cooperative, Moc Chau, Son La
50.	Nguyen Van Trang	Head	Crop Production Division/DARD, Hung Yen province
51.	Nguyen Xuan Chinh	Reporter	Vietnam Television (VTV2)
52.	Park Choon Eun	Deputy Director	KOPIA Project, FAVRI
53.	Quach Dai Hung	Farmers	Hiep Cuong commune, Kim Dong, Hung Yen province
54.	Shashi Sareen	Officer	FAORAP
55.	To Thi Thu Ha	Head	Vegetable and Spice Dept. FAVRI
56.	Tran Khac Thi	Deputy Director	FAVRI
57.	Tran Van Nam	Farmer	Thanh Nghia Cooperative, Don Duong, Lam Dong province
58.	Tran Van Quan	Officer	DARD, Son La province
59.	Trinh Khac Quang	NPD	FAVRI
60.	Vu Dinh Duan	Director	Processing Company (HAVECO)
61.	Vu Ngoc Tien	Rep Assistant	FAO, Hanoi
62.	Vu Thi Hau	Director	Fivimart
63.	Yuriko Shoji	FAOR	FAO, Hanoi